Building a Literature Review: A Citation Analysis of Medical Educator’s Research Patterns in Balint Group Studies

Len L. Levin
University of Massachusetts Medical School

Follow this and additional works at: https://escholarship.umassmed.edu/lib_articles

Part of the Health Communication Commons, Health Psychology Commons, Library and Information Science Commons, and the Medical Education Commons

Repository Citation

Creative Commons License
This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License. This material is brought to you by eScholarship@UMMS. It has been accepted for inclusion in Library Publications and Presentations by an authorized administrator of eScholarship@UMMS. For more information, please contact Lisa.Palmer@umassmed.edu.
Building a Literature Review: A Citation Analysis of Medical Educator’s Patterns in Balint Group Studies

Len Levin, MS LIS, MA, AHIP – Lamar Soutter Library, University of Massachusetts Medical School, Worcester, MA
Young-Joo Lee, MS LIS, MA – Louis Stokes Health Sciences Library, Howard University, Washington, DC

Hypothesis: As librarians highly involved in the research process, an exhaustive, comprehensive literature search is the cornerstone of any project we would undertake. Based on findings in the literature, it has been demonstrated that many medical educators do not use a systematic approach in their pre-intervention reviews. Instead, it is believed that researchers use literature conveniently found and readily available. To test this hypothesis, we conducted a comprehensive review of the literature in relation to Balint theory and then analyzed the citations in papers from the last ten years (2003-2013). The below flow chart demonstrates the methodology used to conduct the review.

Methods

- Identify potentially relevant citations in indexed databases (n=324 following removal of duplication)
  - PubMed: 124
  - Embase: 127
  - Web of Science: 22
  - CINAHL: 10
  - PsycINFO: 61
  - ERIC: 23

- Papers included (n=111)
  - Older than 10 years
  - Bibliographies
  - Opinion-based letters
  - Meeting Abstracts
  - Dissertations

- Papers excluded (n=223)
  - Full text not found (e.g., “esoteric” international journals)

- Additional papers excluded (n=35)
  - Full text not found (e.g., “esoteric” international journals)
  - Paper contained no citations

Papers included. Citations from bibliographies examined (n=31)

- Total number of Balint-related citations: 314
- Number of unique citations: 123

Analysis

Of the 123 unique citations, 31 were books:
- U.S. and international (primarily U.K., Australia and South Africa) resources represented.
- Of these 31 books, 4 were written by Michael or Enid Balint.
- These books represent 74 of the total Balint-related citations (24% of 314)

The top 10 journal articles cited were cited 94 times (see composite collage with link below)
- This speciality search was conducted using the term “Balint” in the medical literature. Specific and interesting findings include:
  - Only a small sample of the available literature (from the early 1950’s when the Balint’s first began publishing on this theory) to the present were cited in recent publications. However, this is a small sample size with limited power and it is uncertain if this citation pattern was indeed “citation by convenience” or choice of the most appropriate resources.
  - Primary resources authored by Michael and Enid Balint were widely represented in the citations.
  - Only one of the titles cited by Lee et al. (2013) as the top 20 medical education-oriented journals appeared in our findings. This was the journal “Family Medicine,” in which seven of the top ten cited articles in our findings were published.
  - Medical educators appear to publish research/case reports on Balint work with medical students and residents in discipline-specific journals as opposed to medical education journals.
  - To further test this hypothesis, additional citation analyses on other medical education-related topics need to be conducted with which these findings can be compared.
  - Librarians involved in medical education are committed to working with researchers in this field to support education research.

Discussion:

- 324 items were discovered in the initial review after searching five databases and removing duplicates. The search strings used (not identical due to differences in database structure) were very basic due to the relative uniqueness of the term “Balint” in the medical literature. Specific and interesting findings include:
  - Only a small sample of the available literature (from the early 1950’s when the Balint’s first began publishing on this theory) to the present were cited in recent publications. However, this is a small sample size with limited power and it is uncertain if this citation pattern was indeed “citation by convenience” or choice of the most appropriate resources.
  - Primary resources authored by Michael and Enid Balint were widely represented in the citations.
  - Only one of the titles cited by Lee et al. (2013) as the top 20 medical education-oriented journals appeared in our findings. This was the journal “Family Medicine,” in which seven of the top ten cited articles in our findings were published.
  - Medical educators appear to publish research/case reports on Balint work with medical students and residents in discipline-specific journals as opposed to medical education journals.
  - To further test this hypothesis, additional citation analyses on other medical education-related topics need to be conducted with which these findings can be compared.
  - Librarians involved in medical education are committed to working with researchers in this field to support education research.